MEMORANDUM

TO: The Diversity & Inclusion Committee:

Frank M. Conner III, Co-Chair
Allison Cryor DiNardo, Co-Chair
Kevin J. Fay
Barbara J. Fried
William H. Goodwin Jr.
Margaret N. Gould
George Keith Martin, Ex-Officio
Christopher P. Holstege, Faculty Consulting Member

and

The Remaining Members of the Board and Senior Advisor:

Frank B. Atkinson
L.D. Britt, M.D.
Helen E. Dragas
Frank E. Genovese
John A. Griffin
Victoria D. Harker

Bobbie G. Kilberg
Stephen P. Long, M.D.
John G. Macfarlane III
Edward D. Miller, M.D.
John L. Nau III

FROM: Susan G. Harris

SUBJECT: Minutes of the Meeting of the Diversity & Inclusion Committee on March 24, 2015

The Diversity & Inclusion Committee of the Board of Visitors of the University of Virginia met, in Open Session, at 11:55 a.m., on Tuesday, March 24, 2015, in the Auditorium of the Albert and Shirley Small Special Collections Library of the Harrison Institute; Mr. Frank M. “Rusty” Conner III and Ms. Allison Cryor DiNardo, Co-Chairs, presided.

Present were George Keith Martin, Kevin J. Fay, Barbara J. Fried, William H. Goodwin Jr., Margaret N. Gould, and Christopher P. Holstege, M.D.
Other Board members present were Frank B. Atkinson, Helen E. Dragas, John A. Griffin, Bobbie G. Kilberg, Stephen P. Long, M.D., and John G. Macfarlane III.

Present as well were Teresa A. Sullivan, Susan G. Harris, Donna P. Henry, Patrick D. Hogan, Marcus M. Martin, M.D., Nancy A. Rivers, Roscoe C. Roberts, Colette Sheehy, John D. Simon, and Debra D. Rinker.

Kerry Abrams and Marcus L. Martin, M.D. were the presenters.

Ms. DiNardo welcomed members of the committee and then turned the meeting over to Mr. Conner for some opening remarks. His remarks are provided verbatim as follows:

   Our agenda was set today several weeks ago because it takes time to prepare for it and the like, well before the incident of last week and so the agenda seems to be in a little bit of dissidence with what a lot of people are really concerned about in the University community and rightfully so as it relates to Diversity and Inclusion. And so, we want to acknowledge that. We also want to acknowledge and endorse our Rector’s comments earlier today about that incident. It raises a whole host of issues. One, about the appropriateness of how we are enforcing our alcohol consumption laws, and second, the disproportionate use of force by certain law enforcement agencies relative to acts that are alleged to have been committed, and obviously a third issue which we’ve seen an awful lot of upsetting information about is the application of the criminal justice system to the African American community and in particular to African American men.

   These are very large issues that our society needs to address. It also, within our community, has raised a number of issues relating to the experience that African Americans, and I would suggest, all minorities feel in the University community.

   So, we are going to embark upon some very serious and very real and very genuine discussions with members of all of our minority communities and I want to acknowledge that so conversation is the first step in developing actions that can actually make a difference and we are going to do that. It is unfortunate that this conversation is going to be started as a result of an incident last week, but we are going to be very much a part of that and I didn’t want you to think that we were going to go forward with the normal agenda without acknowledging the very real issues that we now need to tackle. So, that is my sentiment and it is shared by my co-chair and I am sure all members of this committee.

   Ms. DiNardo went quickly through the agenda items and then asked Dr. Martin to address the committee.
Faculty Salary Study Report

Dr. Martin explained the history of the faculty salary study, and said the American Association of University Professors (AAUP) had found nationally that women’s salaries lagged those of men. He said the plan to conduct a faculty salary study was initiated in 2012: a study task force was appointed by Provost Simon in October 2012. Ms. Sarah Turner chaired the task force and provided reports to the Board in February 2013 and February 2014. Provost Simon wrote a letter to the faculty explaining the results of the study, which is provided as Attachment A to these minutes. Ms. Turner and Ms. Kerry Abrams also provided information to the Board during the September 2014 meeting.

Dr. Martin introduced Ms. Kerry Abrams, the Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs and Professor of Law. Ms. Abrams echoed the co-chair’s comments that it may seem inappropriate to think about faculty at a moment like this, however, faculty diversity and faculty equity are linked to the student experience. She said the faculty equity study found that on average women, tenured and tenure track (excluding the School of Medicine), made 2.7% less than their male peers. The results varied at different ranks within the professorial ranks. At the assistant level, women were doing slightly better than men. At the associate level, the gap widened to 4%. At the full professor level, it was 3.4%. There were no statistical differences for race, citizenship, or nation of origin because the numbers within these groups were so small that a statistical difference could not be determined.

As a follow-up to the study, Provost Simon and Ms. Abrams met with each dean to discuss the results and what they might do in their school in the short-term as a remedy. The deans added in to the analysis performance measures by which they had set faculty salaries for their individual schools. Once performance had been added, they were able to determine if the faculty salaries were appropriate. In many cases, they decided to make equity adjustments. Ms. Abrams said it is important to recognize that one set of salary equity adjustments does not solve a long-term issue regarding race and gender.

Most of the deans found compression issues. For example, if a faculty member arrived at the University or was granted tenure at a time when salaries were static for several years in a row, they were more likely to jump out in the analysis as requiring an equity adjustment. So, both men and women received equity adjustments. In many of Ms. Abrams’ conversations with the deans, it became clear there may be other factors besides compression leading to gender inequity in salary; these factors will require further study and intervention. Going forward, Ms. Abrams sees her task as two-fold: 1) determining if the way the University is measuring performance has any built-in biases; and 2) making sure we are creating an atmosphere in which women can thrive. A large part of Ms. Abrams’ work has been her partnership with UVa Charge – a group on Grounds that has a National Science Foundation advance grant to study women in science, technology, engineering, and math (STEM) and social, behavioral, and economic (SBE) fields. They have been analyzing the experiences of
Diversity & Inclusion Committee March 24, 2015

women in the STEM/SBE fields at the University and working to create a better climate for those faculty. She is working with them to expand beyond those fields to the entire faculty. In the second phase of the study non-tenured faculty will also be included as well as faculty in the School of Medicine.

Report by the Vice President and Chief Officer for Diversity and Equity

Dr. Martin reported on the Martin Luther King Jr. celebrations in January. He said President Sullivan, vice presidents, and deans have been very supportive over the five years of two-week celebrations. He said this was an opportunity to work with the community to illustrate our commitment to community partnerships.

Dr. Martin said the Office for Diversity and Equity engages a broad range of community and University representatives in celebration planning. Each year, deans are asked to appoint a representative to the MLK Celebration Planning Committee, and nearly 100 individuals, including faculty, staff, students and members of the community, work each year with enthusiasm. This year, there were approximately 25 events. These events had a wide appeal around the ideals of equality, civility, and mutual respect. Events included panel discussions, workshops, lectures, film screenings, shadowing opportunities in the Health System for local high school and college students interested in health care careers, and musical and theatrical performances. A list of MLK events can be found in Attachment B of these minutes. A video of the MLK events, “Giving Voice”, can be found at:  https://vimeo.com/119387099

Dr. Martin gave an overview of the charge for the President’s Commission on Slavery and the University. Elements of the charge are:

• Research the University of Virginia’s historical relationship with slavery.
• Communicate contributions of the enslaved.
• Educate students, faculty, staff, alumni, visitors, and community about the legacy of slavery.
• Provide advice and recommendations on commemoration.

Ideas that will be discussed with President Sullivan include converting some known slave spaces into interpretive educational centers; integrating the history of slavery at the University into interactive media in the Rotunda Visitors Center; creating one or more physical memorials to the enslaved; creating scholarships and professorships; developing a course and curriculum on slavery; producing scholarly reports and papers; improving relations with the community; institutionalizing projects to promote diversity and inclusion beyond the life of a commission and beyond the life of the Office for Diversity and Equity; and naming one or more buildings after slaves.

Dr. Martin thanked the Buildings and Grounds Committee for passing a resolution to name the Alderman Road Residence Hall Building #6 the Gibbons
House. He said this was a major milestone for the University; there are few peer institutions that have named buildings after slaves.

Dr. Martin reported on activities within his office. They have recently hired a post-doctorate research associate, and with the generous support of John and Bobbie Nau and the John and Amy Griffin Foundation, last fall they held a symposium: Universities Confronting the Legacy of Slavery. Approximately 400 people attended the symposium, representing over 15 institutions of higher learning. Sessions were held at the Jefferson School, which is where Isabella Gibbons taught as the first teacher of color after emancipation. There were also sessions at First Baptist Church on Main Street, where her husband, William Gibbons, served as a minister when he was emancipated. There was a commemoration at the African American Cemetery, including a poem commissioned by Brenda Marie Osbey about those who are interred there in unmarked graves. The cemetery pathway was lit by luminarium and a local choir sang, led by Reverend Armeda Miller of Richmond. The film “Unearthed and Understood, Slavery at the University of Virginia” was also commissioned. On Founders Day, April 13, a tree will be planted near the Rotunda in honor of the slaves who lived and worked at the University.

- - - - - - - - - -

On motion, the committee adjourned at 12:25 p.m.

SGH:ddr

These minutes have been posted to the University of Virginia’s Board of Visitors website: http://www.virginia.edu/bov/diversityandinclusioncommitteeminutes.html
Message from Provost Simon regarding Faculty Salary Study
Wednesday, August 20, 2014 1:03 PM

Dear Faculty,

I am pleased to announce that the Faculty Salary Study Task Force has issued its report, and I write to summarize the report's findings and to let you know our first steps toward addressing the recommendations. The full report is available on the website for the Office of the Executive Vice President and Provost at: http://provost.virginia.edu/provost-office-task-force-and-committees/faculty-salary-study.

This is the first detailed salary study of the tenured and tenure-track faculty to be undertaken at the University of Virginia. I want to thank task force members Sarah Turner (Chair), Silvia Blemker, Greg Fairchild, Amalia Miller, Eric Patashnik, Sara Rimm-Kaufman, Rip Verkerke, and Tim Wilson for their excellent work. In addition, I want to recognize the contributions of Gertrude Fraser, Marcus Martin, Susan Carkeek, Kerry Abrams, and Madelyn Wessel, all of whom served in ex officio capacities. The task force was commissioned by my office to conduct a rigorous examination of faculty salaries at the University of Virginia. The task force was given confidential access to extensive quantitative information about tenured and tenure-track faculty in all schools but Medicine. This information included the salary of each faculty member in four particular years (2013, 2012, 2007, and 2003).

Key Findings:
The task force determined that certain important variables such as rank (assistant, associate, or full professor), the faculty member's school or department (discipline), the number of years since receipt of a graduate degree, and the number of years at UVa, were all essential to account for in its analysis. These factors have also been viewed as required in other recent University equity studies, as salaries vary widely across academic disciplines, schools, experience, and rank. Once it had accounted for these variables, the task force found that, on average, for the 2013 salary data, male faculty members made 2.7% more than female faculty members, an average annual difference of $3,638. The difference in pay was larger at the Associate and Full Professor ranks, reversed at the Assistant Professor rank, and most statistically significant at the Associate rank. As has been the case in other recent University salary equity studies, the task force did not (and could not) incorporate qualitative factors that may affect salaries in individual cases such as annual performance evaluations, peer review, scholarly productivity, research funding, service or
teaching contributions, or outside offers into its quantitative analysis. This work remains to be, and will be done.

It is important to note this finding is not unique to the University of Virginia or to higher education. Policy discussions and reviews regarding this issue are taking place in numerous industries. This study also comes at a time when the University is committed to increasing overall faculty compensation to be in the top 20 of our AAU peers.

Task Force Recommendations and Next Steps:
The report recommended several actions, each of which we are pursuing. Kerry Abrams, Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs (kerryabrams@virginia.edu), will be responsible for leading the administrative activities associated with the report. First, Kerry and I will be meeting individually with the school deans to discuss the results of the study and require that careful qualitative assessments of faculty salaries be undertaken by each school and department. These assessments will include review of the factors noted above which could not be quantitatively evaluated by the task force. It is anticipated that some salary adjustments will be made. Even though the task force was unable to reach conclusions about disparities based on race or citizenship, we will be closely scrutinizing individual cases to ensure that any appropriate salary adjustments are made. Although the report's findings would suggest that women's salaries are more likely to require adjustment, this process will include both men and women to ensure that all faculty members whose salaries were found to exhibit a statistical parity difference receive fair and equitable review.

Kerry will also carefully assess institutional practices that could differentially affect faculty success, soliciting input broadly from our University community and forming advisory groups where needed. While the report found a 2.7% salary differential between male and female faculty, the cause of this differential is not ascertainable from the data studied. The Provost's office will be investigating several potential underlying causes identified in the report, including: the allocation of resources that lead to research productivity (such as lab space and research assistance); the assignment to committees and assessment of institutional service; efforts made to mentor junior colleagues; assistance provided to tenured faculty seeking promotion; the observed gender disparity in the rate and timing of progression from associate to full professor; and whether there are any gender disparities in hiring and salary-setting for senior new hires coming from other institutions. Some of this work has already begun through UVa CHARGE, an NSF ADVANCE program designed to increase the representation and advancement of
women in academic science, technology, engineering and math (STEM) and social, behavioral and economic (SBE) science careers. We will expand the activities begun by the ADVANCE group to include faculty outside the STEM and SBE fields.

Finally, we recognize that achieving fully equitable representation and compensation at the University requires long-term study and engagement. The Provost's office will continue to track the variables analyzed in the study; work to develop new, more nuanced methods of studying faculty salary; and commission appropriate reports to measure our progress over time.

President Sullivan and I intend to expand salary equity review beyond the group studied by the Task Force. Kerry has reached out to the leadership of the General Faculty Council and the Executive Vice President for Health Affairs to begin the process of studying salary equity issues among the non-tenure-track faculty and to enable a similar study for the faculty in the School of Medicine.

Best regards,

John

John D. Simon
Executive Vice President and Provost
Martin Luther King Jr. Celebration
2015 Calendar of Events

SATURDAY, JANUARY 17
10:00 AM - 8:00 PM
Draw-athon
Jefferson School African American Heritage Center

3:00 PM
Starr Hill Walking Tour
Jefferson School City Center - Commerce Street Steps

6:00 PM
Community Dialogue on Race
City Hall Chambers

SUNDAY, JANUARY 18
1:00 - 5:00 PM
The Bridge to Ridge Community Arts Festival
Mt. Zion First African Baptist Church

5:00 PM
30th Annual Martin Luther King, Jr. Community Celebration Service
Mt. Zion First African Baptist Church

MONDAY, JANUARY 19
12:30 PM
Day in the Life of a Healthcare Professional
University of Virginia Medical Center

12:00 PM
"Living the Dream: A Celebration of the Life and Work of Martin Luther King Jr."
Hospital Chapel, University of Virginia Medical Center

1:00 PM
"Until the Quiet Comes: Cinema Under Radar"
Screening of Three Short Films
Ruffin Hall 103

1:00 - 3:00 PM
"Continuing the Dream"
Carver Recreation Center

4:00 PM
"Diversity in Health Care Education and Practice"
Speaker: Marc Nivet
McCleod Hall Auditorium
5:00 - 7:00 PM
"Tense Boundaries: Activism at the Intersection of Race and Gender"
Teach-In
Chemistry 304

TUESDAY, JANUARY 20
12:30 - 1:45 PM
"Until the Quiet Comes: Cinema Under Radar"
Film Discussion
Minor Hall 125

4:00 - 6:00 PM
"The Sound of Civil Rights: Jazz, Blues, Funk, and the Shape of Change to Come"
Teach-In
Minor 125

7:00 PM
Film Screening: First Generation
Newcomb Theater

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 21
5:30 PM
Interfaith Worship Service
Brody Jewish Center at the University of Virginia

THURSDAY, JANUARY 22,
6:00 PM
TA-NEHISI COATES
"Legacy and Justice: Civil Rights in the Modern Era"
Keynote Address
Culbreth Theater

FRIDAY, JANUARY 23
2:00 - 4:00 PM
"Black Lives Matter: More than Just a Statement"
Auditorium of the Albert and Shirley Small Special Collections Library

6:00 PM
"The Other Movement Inspired by Dr. King and the African American Struggle for Civil Rights"
Speaker: Dr. Glenn B. Anderson
Holloway Hall (Bavaro Hall 116), Curry School of Education
SATURDAY, JANUARY 24
10:00 AM - 12:00 PM
*Postponed to February 7th Due to Inclement Weather*
"Empowering Caregivers: African Americans and Alzheimer's Disease"
Jefferson School African American Heritage Center

SUNDAY, JANUARY 25
7:00 PM
Raisin' Cane: A Harlem Renaissance Odyssey
The Paramount Theater

MONDAY, JANUARY 26
10:30 AM
Raisin' Cane: A Harlem Renaissance Odyssey (Arts Education Performance)
The Paramount Theater

TUESDAY, JANUARY 27
1:30-2:30 PM
"Industries, Influence, and the Journey: Celebrating Diversity in Business"
Panel Discussion
Saunders Hall, Classroom 180, Darden School of Business

3:30 - 5:00 PM
"Continuing Education at U.Va.: Early Service to Women and African Americans"
Auditorium of the Albert and Shirley Small Special Collections Library

6:00 PM - 8:00 PM
"Slavery at the University of Virginia"
Film Screening and Panel Discussion
Jefferson School African American Heritage Center