TO: The Educational Policy Committee:

Frank B. Atkinson, Co-Chair
Stephen P. Long, M.D., Co-Chair
L.D. Britt, M.D.
Allison Cryor DiNardo
Helen E. Dragas
Frank E. Genovese
Margaret N. Gould
George Keith Martin, Ex-officio
Christopher P. Holstege, M.D., Faculty Consulting Member

and

The Remaining Members and Senior Advisor to the Board:

Frank M. Conner III Bobbie G. Kilberg
Kevin J. Fay John G. Macfarlane III
Barbara J. Fried Edward D. Miller, M.D.
William H. Goodwin Jr. John L. Nau III
John A. Griffin
Victoria D. Harker

FROM: Susan G. Harris

RE: Minutes of the Educational Policy Committee on March 24, 2015

The Educational Policy Committee of the Board of Visitors of the University of Virginia met, in Open Session, at 9:15 a.m., on Tuesday, March 24, 2015, in the Auditorium of the Albert & Shirley Small Special Collections Library of the Harrison Institute; Frank B. Atkinson and Stephen P. Long, M.D., Co-Chairs, presided.

Present were Allison Cryor DiNardo, Frank E. Genovese, Margaret N. Gould, and Christopher P. Holstege, M.D. L.D. Britt, M.D., participated by phone.

Present as well were Teresa A. Sullivan, Susan G. Harris, Susan Carkeek, Richard C. Kast, John D. Simon, and Debra D. Rinker.
Remarks by the Committee Co-Chairs

Dr. Long, Co-Chair, opened the meeting with brief remarks and a welcome to our incoming student Board member, Daniel T. Judge. Dr. Long turned the meeting over to the Rector who wanted to make some opening remarks as well.

Opening Remarks by the Rector

Rector Martin wanted to make a statement early in the meeting regarding Martese Johnson, a University of Virginia student who was injured by an ABC agent on the Corner near University Grounds. Mr. Martin’s remarks are reported verbatim:

Good morning. Like all of you, I was distressed to see the media coverage about one of our students, Martese Johnson, bleeding from a head injury sustained at the hands of ABC agents.

First and foremost, we are deeply concerned about the safety and security of our students — all of our students, regardless of the circumstances. Threats to student safety must be addressed, whether the source of the danger is external or internal.

Our immediate concerns are for Martese and his family. This is a young man who experienced a traumatic event and sustained a head injury requiring ten stitches. I have spoken with him and shared with him our deep concern for his well-being.

Reflecting on this episode, I cannot ignore the fact that Martese is an African-American. I cannot ignore the fact that I have been contacted by African-American alumni who are concerned. But I also have been contacted by alums who are not African Americans and they, too, are concerned about Martese.

I know I speak for the Board when I say this matter is important to us because it involves one of our students, and we do not want to see something like this happen ever again to any of our students. Indeed, less than two years ago another one of our students, Elizabeth Daley, had a traumatic encounter with ABC agents. We will obviously wait to see what the State investigation yields, but we do not want to pick up a newspaper ever again to see a picture of one of our students with a bloody face. That should not happen.

I have spoken with the Governor and I thanked him for acting on President Sullivan’s request for an independent investigation. I assured him that UVa would cooperate with the investigation, and that we all want the truth. The Governor indicated that this matter will receive the highest priority. Of course, an investigation alone will not be enough. The State of Virginia must take affirmative steps to prevent that this type of event in the future.
The issues involving underage drinking are very complex, and people with good intentions have differing views of how best to address them. Good solutions require goodwill and good behavior from all parties — students, University officials, proprietors, police officers, indeed all of us. Regarding the ABC agents in particular, even before last week’s incident, many people, including members of the General Assembly, had expressed concern about that agency’s enforcement activities and training practices. I have personally received complaints about them from parents and alums. We know what good law enforcement looks like because we are the beneficiaries of the dedicated work of our own University police department and in our close working relationship with Chief Longo and his dedicated officers. Where the safety and security of students are concerned, we can accept no less from anyone.

Again, I regret that this incident occurred and I know that you will join me as we continue to keep Martese and his family in our prayers and our thoughts.

Rector Martin stated that he would be interrupting the agenda one more time later today. He asked Joy Omenyi, President of the Black Student Alliance, to address the Board today. She will be attending the conclusion of the Finance Subcommittee to address the full Board.

Consent Item: Program Closure: M.A. in Digital Humanities

Dr. Long said this was an official matter that needed to come before the Board. It has already been coordinated with SCHEV and the University appropriate channels through the Faculty Senate.

On motion, the Committee approved the following resolution and recommended it for full Board approval:

**CLOSURE OF THE M.A. PROGRAM IN DIGITAL HUMANITIES**

RESOLVED, after review by the University, the State Council of Higher Education for Virginia, and the Faculty Senate, the M.A. program in Digital Humanities is approved for closure in May 2015.


Dr. Long explained the William Parson Visiting Professorship in Teaching Excellence was originally conceived as a visiting professorship based on the idea that bringing in a different scholar each year would provide students the opportunity to engage with and learn from a more diverse group of talented scholars. Logistics and other matters presented this from ever being effective so the Anderson’s, who launched this effort, agreed to rename this professorship to take away the “visiting” designation from the title.
On motion, the Committee approved the following resolution and recommended it for full Board approval:

RENAMEING THE WILLIAM PARSON VISITING PROFESSORSHIP IN TEACHING EXCELLENCE TO THE WILLIAM PARSON PROFESSORSHIP IN TEACHING EXCELLENCE

WHEREAS, Dr. William Parson served as chair of the Department of Internal Medicine in the School of Medicine from 1949 to 1966; and

WHEREAS, in 2000, Dr. Dudley B. Anderson, a former student of Dr. Parson’s, launched a successful effort to establish a professorship honoring Dr. Parson’s renowned commitment to medical education; and

WHEREAS, on April 6, 2001, the Board of Visitors established the William Parson Visiting Professorship in Teaching Excellence; and

WHEREAS, the School of Medicine feels the original intent of the professorship can be met more effectively by providing a professorship for one of its own outstanding teachers, and therefore wishes to end the visiting nature of the professorship; and

WHEREAS, the University, the School of Medicine, and the donors who executed the fund agreement to establish the professorship, Dr. Dudley B. Anderson and Mrs. Lisa S. Anderson, agreed to this change in an addendum executed on December 17, 2014;

RESOLVED, the Board of Visitors renames the William Parson Visiting Professorship in Teaching Excellence the William Parson Professorship in Teaching Excellence.


President Sullivan began her presentation by providing the committee members with a “Consumer Information” document that contains information about our undergraduate tuition, graduation rates, and retention rates. The General Assembly asked that we provide this information to the public in accordance with Section 23-2.6 of the Code of Virginia. This document can be found at: http://www.virginia.edu/virginia/documents/ConsumerInfo_2015.pdf.

President Sullivan said the Obama Administration has been working for two years on a ratings system for all colleges and universities. Their goal is to increase transparency and improve access to higher education. We do not yet know what the exact metrics will be or how they will be weighted.

According to the Department of Education, the rating system is needed for multiple purposes, including “to recognize institutions that are succeeding at expanding access, maintaining affordability, and ensuring strong student outcomes”. They want to provide this rating plan in one place so that any consumer can look at it. There is concern that the rating system will ultimately be used to
disqualify some schools from federal funding. For this and for other reasons, political opposition to the plan has arisen.

The Department of Education plans to limit the ratings to a small number of performance categories. The President emphasized these are ratings not rankings. The categories will include: high-performing institutions, low-performing institutions, and institutions falling in the middle. This will be a ratings system, using broad categories to highlight significant success and weakness, not intended to be a numerical ranking of institutions.

The rating system will group two-year institutions and four-year institutions into separate categories. However, for-profit and non-profit institutions will be considered. The initial version of the rating system will only take into account the undergraduate student population.

Secretary of Education Arne Duncan has asked for commentary from universities on the proposed system and established a web site for this purpose. In February, President Sullivan responded in writing and offered several recommendations on the proposed system. These recommendations address four major areas:

1. Institutional Grouping: The proposed grouping of institutions into two categories, one for two-year institutions and one for four-year institutions, fails to account sufficiently for the unique missions and student populations of the various colleges and universities throughout the United States.

2. Data: Due to the absence of one central source of credible information on several of the proposed metrics, we are concerned about the reliability of data on certain proposed metrics, such as labor market success. The current plan to use data from the Integrated Postsecondary Education System (IPEDS) and National Student Loan Data System (NSLDS), which provide information only for financial aid recipients, are far too narrow in scope. We have requested that the Department allow institutions to supplement with institutional data or data from the Common Data Set, which will project a more accurate view of the institution and its students.

   • The College Navigator website, for example, already contains a wealth of information and allows for families to compare key indicators across institutions online.

3. Ratings Categories: By presenting scores individually for each metric, as well as an overall total, the rating system could be used as a consumer tool for prospective students and families to identify their priorities by institution.

4. Performance Metrics: Information reported should reflect data over a period of time versus a single snapshot per year.

President Sullivan highlighted some of the metrics that have been proposed to be included by the Department of Education:
Pell Recipients: At 13.2%, UVa ranks lower than most of its peers in the percent of undergraduate students who are Pell recipients. However, UVa has almost doubled the number of Pell recipients since the implementation of AccessUVa in 2006. The proportion of Pell recipients should be presented in a time series, rather than a snapshot of an individual student cohort for a single year.

Average Net Price: The average net price for all UVa full-time, first year, in-state undergraduate students who received need-based grants in fall 2013 was $14,069.

First Generation Students: The University of Virginia began collecting first generation information on its undergraduate application in 2012. In the fall 2014, 9% of the first-year class and 17% of the transfer class were first generation students. Given that there is little or no peer data currently available on this metric, President Sullivan has suggested that the Department of Education consider reporting this number in terms of institutional improvement over time.

Graduate School Attendance: Among respondents to a 2013 survey of U.Va. alumni two years after graduation, 46% reported either having completed or being currently enrolled in a graduate degree program.

Completion Rates: At 94.1%, U.Va.'s most recent six-year graduation rate is the highest of all public institutions in the nation. An additional 2.3% transferred out and earned a bachelor's degree at another institution. Comparable rates for full-time transfer students are 93.1% graduating from UVa in six years, with an additional 1.7% receiving a bachelor's degree from another institution.

Labor Market Success: According to PayScale, U.Va. graduates' average early-career salary is $54,100 and mid-career salary is $99,300. UVa ranks 68th nationally (in the 93rd percentile) out of over 1,000 four-year institutions for mid-career salary. Among research universities, U.Va. ranks 36th out of 267 institutions (86th percentile), 22nd out of 61 (64th percentile) among AAU institutions, and 4th among AAU publics.

Despite our strong standing, we are concerned about the reliability of reporting on data like labor market success. Given our strong commitment to public service, many of our students pursue careers in public service. For example in 2012, U.Va. had 69 alumni who were working for the Peace Corps and U.Va was one of the top 10 institutions for Teach for America. Military service is another valuable service but is not compensated as well as comparable civilian occupation. With this in mind, President Sullivan shared with the Department of Education that we oppose any metric that would serve as disincentive to service.
Loan Performance Outcomes: U.Va.'s most recent (FY 2011) official three-year loan default rate from the National Student Loan Data System is 1.7%. The national average for four-year public institutions is 8.9% and for private four-year institutions is 7.0%. The average for all institutions in Virginia is 10.0%.

President Sullivan made it clear that the University is not opposed to accountability. She said we are more than happy to provide information that is portrayed in a meaningful context so that consumers can evaluate it fairly.

Two weeks ago, a proposal arose from the Federal Government to create two rating systems: one for consumers and one for researchers. The one for researchers would be standardized by the characteristics of the student population. For example, a school that serves a historically underserved population, might have a low graduation rate but if you standardized it for the kind of students they serve, the graduation rate would look higher. There is a lot of concern that this will confuse consumers who see one graduation rate on the consumer rating and then on the research one see a higher graduation rate. President Sullivan was not sure what the fate of this proposal would be but the administration has indicated that by this fall they do hope to have a rating system present.

Report: Briefing on the Partnership for a Joint Laboratory with the Max Planck Institute for Chemical Energy Conversion (MPI)

Mr. Phil Parrish, the interim Vice President for Research gave a presentation on a research initiative with Max Planck Institute for chemical energy conversion. He said MaxNet Energy is an initiative within the Max Planck Society on the topic of energy. It involves seven of the leading institutes within the Max Planck Society and is led by the one called the max Planck Institute for Chemical Energy Conversion. The Max Planck Society was formed in 1911 and is Germany’s most recognized and acclaimed research organization – 32 Nobel laureates since its creation. In 2006, Times Higher Education ranked them No. 1 in the world for science research.

Mr. Parrish said the reason we were able to achieve this partnership was based on the very high quality of our faculty, many of whom have been recognized internationally and nationally as leaders in their fields. It has become a platform for faculty and students to engage internationally – to travel to Germany to work in these labs from time to time in collaboration with scientists there and to use instrumentation that is sometimes not available at many locations in the world. Mr. Parrish anticipates that this will lead to significant additional external research funding. He said he greatly appreciates the President providing funding from the President’s Excellence Fund, as well as the support from Dean Baucom and Dean Aylor, in helping them to launch this initiative.

Mr. Parrish gave the committee members the names of the initial U.Va. faculty involved in this initiative: Ian Harrison (Chemistry),
John Yates (Chemistry), Hossein Haj-Hariri (Mechanical & Aerospace Engineering), Bob Davis (Chemical Engineering), Giovanni Zangari (Materials Science & Engineering), Brent Gunnoe (Chemistry), Petra Reinke (Materials Science & Engineering), Gary Koenig (Chemical Engineering), and Harsha Chelliah (Mechanical & Aerospace Engineering). Mr. Brent Gunnoe will serve as the inaugural director of the program. Initially, there are several joint projects that are being launched: Solar Process Heat, Photo-Electrocatalysis (sunlight to fuels), and Natural Gas to Liquid Fuels. Mr. Parrish said the goal is to find external support for these initiatives. The funding that has been provided so far is joint funding from U.Va. and the Max Planck Society and is viewed as seed funding. We anticipate new projects being externally funding, that seed funding may be extended to other faculty over time in a competitive way internally, so we expect this work to continue.

The Max Planck Energy platform has been put in place by the Max Planck Society for a period of 10 years and is renewable so we anticipate a long-term relationship out of this. He said U.Va. is one of two universities with an affiliation as a center with the Max Planck Society – the other being Princeton on plasma physics. We look forward to a sustainable research collaboration with Max Planck and very expanded research in energy at U.Va. from this collaboration.

Report: Advising Panel Discussion

Dr. Long began this session by emphasizing the importance of advising. Parents are especially interested in this topic. It is also the second strategy for the Cornerstone Plan Pillar of improving residential culture. Dr. Long introduced Meg Gould, Student Board Member, who organized this session of the meeting. Ms. Gould introduced the Vice Provost for Academic Affairs and Professor of Art History, who set the foundation for this panel discussion. Ms. McInnis said advising focuses on three areas: academic, personal, and career; these should be seen as integrated areas and not separate ones. She briefly went over the data from the Student Experience in the Research University (SERU) survey from 2014.

The discussion panel consisted of the following students: Carey Stewart – fourth year global public health and distinguished biology major from Athens GA – serves as Student Council’s Chief of Cabinet; Whitney Nichols – fourth year cognitive psychology major from Suffolk VA – serves as a Senior Peer Advisor for the office of African American Affairs and a Co-Facilitator for the Big Sister in the Young Women’s Leadership Program; Daniel Judge – third year political, philosophy, policy and law major from Berryville VA – serves as Co-Chair of the Student Council’s Academic Affairs Committee, advisor from ULINK and upcoming student board member; Molly Cudahy – fourth year sociology and women & general studies major from Herndon VA – serves as a career peer education; and Erick Roberts – first year from Potomac MD in the College of Arts & Sciences – serves as the First Year President and a member of the Student Council Representative Body. Each of these students shared their experiences where advising
was concerned. Some of the advice/ideas which came from the panelists were: make COLA more accessible, have faculty be more involved, have a welcome session in career advising, need to get students involved early, and more advising in science and medicine is needed.

On motion, the Educational Policy Committee meeting was adjourned at 10:25 a.m.

SGH:ddr
These minutes have been posted to the University of Virginia’s Board of Visitors website:  http://www.virginia.edu/bov/educationalminutes.html